

XXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXX, 2016

Scout Name,

Here are my initial comments as representative of the San Gabriel District. I have signed your report and you may proceed with your project. However, please read the comments below and sincerely consider adding details as appropriate. Any project can add and benefit from additional detail.

First, please confirm once again that you are using the latest version of the workbook. The latest version is available at <http://www.scouting.org/scoutsource/BoyScouts/AdvancementandAwards/Resources.aspx>. The version is No. 512-927. The council is being firm that the latest version needs to be used.

Then, I'll say this: (and I say this for all projects I review) the current version of the workbook is not my favorite. In my opinion it glosses over what a significant learning experience prepping for a project can be. All I can do as the district rep is to look at the five tests of an acceptable Eagle Scout Service Project (see the instructions page and the bottom of this letter) and say that the project is feasible and meets the five tests. Previous versions allowed for much more coaching and requiring revisions, things that happen in the real world of project proposals and approvals. So, a lot of what I am saying from here on I really cannot require. However, I can say that your project will be much more likely to succeed and be viewed more favorably at the district, council and national offices IF you are willing to add details. **Also, the second part of the workbook is critical: you should complete this section and discuss with the beneficiary, your Scoutmaster and your Eagle Scout mentor before proceeding with the actual project.**

So on to my comments:

1. For every section, use this rule: Suppose on the day or days of your project you are so sick you can't get out of bed and the only person you can contact is the newest 2nd Class Scout in the troop. Ask yourself this question: Is there enough information in each section that he could run your project successfully? If there is any doubt, add details. Additional sheets are OK.
2. Under "Project Description and Benefit" additional details can provide clarity. Overall you did a good job for this section. It is always good to think about how your project fits into the beneficiary's plans. Is this a project that is being requested by a group or did it come specifically from the beneficiary? Who suggested the project or how did you come to know about it? What might you add to your project description to inform about your project? For example, under supplies you mention concrete pavers. Are the benches to be permanently fixed in place and, if so, is there adequate shade or other protection from the elements? Are there reasons why you have a wide range for the completion date ("middle of September")?
3. Under "Giving Leadership." How many man-hours do you think your project will take; i.e., why do you think 15 is the right number of people? What message are you using to recruit? Some additional leadership questions you might ask yourself is this: "How will I deal with working with young scouts or any other issues possibly causing work distractions and an unsafe environment?" Be sure to review the Guide to Safe Scouting (available at <http://www.scouting.org/filestore/pdf/34416.pdf>). The rules for use of power equipment has been revised from what were the previous, unreasonable limits. However, there are age-guidelines for use of certain tools such as small power sanders (See pages 93 and 94 of the

Guide.) You will likely be directing adults so what do you think you need to anticipate and plan for supervising people older than you? Look at my comment under safety and think about whether or not you need a couple of others to help with safety.

4. Under “Materials, Supplies and Tools and Other Needs.” (I’m looking at these topics together). You might note where materials, supplies and tools are expected to be sourced or obtained. What items (tools, water cooler, for example) are you borrowing or expecting others to supply? Are you planning on renting the pressure washer; will it be available on the days you want to do your project?
5. Under “Permits and permissions.” Please note that this topic is permits AND permissions. Some clarity here would help. You are obviously working with xxxxxxxxxx at the church, so is he/she responsible for the permission?
6. Under “Preliminary Cost Estimate.” Additional detail here would be good. Your estimate seems pretty low. Have you actually priced materials? Where are you planning get in-kind donations; i.e., which hardware or lumber companies? **Remember, it’s OK to attach additional pages.** What will you do if donations (or fundraising) is short of your goal or does not meet your timing plans?
7. Under “Project Phases.” Good catch in noting that number 1 is preparation of project plan; see my # 10 below. Don’t get overly complicated but also remember point #1 above.
8. Remember under “Logistics” that any driving and transportation should follow the “Guide to Safe Scouting” as well as maintaining G2SS for 2-deep leadership.
9. **IF THERE IS ONE TOPIC THAT I INSIST ON ADDITIONAL DETAILS IT IS SAFETY!** I can insist on this because it is item #3 in the list of things I can specifically address. You might specify who is providing the first aid kit under “Supplies”, who will provide it and if anyone has the specific skills to use. Under safety issues you probably should 1) identify who will make decisions about safety, 2) who will decide when medical care is needed or if the first aid kit is adequate and 3) what emergency procedures will be.

We always need to plan because accidents unfortunately do happen, so who will make the decision and provide a band aid, who will make the decision that a trip to the emergency room is needed and how that transport will occur, and, certainly we hope not, but who would make the decision to call 911? You should identify the nearest medical facilities (in Georgetown) but might it be a good idea to have more detail about those facilities? A full hospital emergency room might not be needed so work with your Eagle mentor to identify different types of care facilities that might be appropriate. Again, this might be one of those delegated tasks – see my #3 above. Finally, for this topic take a look at any active merit badge pamphlet and go through the requirement #1 exercise. The requirement for Home Repairs Merit Badge provides a good example:

*Do the following:*

- a. *Explain to your counselor the most likely hazards you may encounter while working on home repairs and what you should do to anticipate, mitigate and prevent, and respond to these hazards. Describe the appropriate safety gear and clothing that should be used when working on home repairs.*
- b. *Discuss general precautions related to home repairs. Name at least 10 safe practices that every home repairer should exercise.*

10. Under “Project Planning” be sure to review the second part of the Eagle Scout Project Workbook. The second part is really the meat of what a project plan should look like and, in my opinion, although it does not require any signatures, it covers everything that a real project proposal should contain. The second section might prompt you to remember things you should put in the proposal. So, don’t forget your final write up!

You've started a good list here – Good Job! – too many scouts gloss over this item.

11. Be sure to consult often with your Scoutmaster and Eagle Scout mentor.

Finally, remember point 1 above.

This is a good time for a visit to your Eagle Scout mentor make sure you are on track.

*One more thing. This is not under the scope of your project, but it is an area for which I have a specific expertise as a Certified Playground Safety Inspector (through my job). The playground equipment is relatively new, but it is always a good idea to review safety issues. I have access to a safety inspection manual and an inspection equipment kit. I'd be happy to do a courtesy inspection in conjunction with your project and visit with the beneficiary about any issues or concerns.*

Good luck! Please feel free to contact me about any of these comments. I look forward to seeing you at your Eagle Scout Board of Review.

YiS,

Gary Boyd

San Gabriel District Eagle Scout Coordinator

512/487-2186 (Leave a message. I often do not answer calls from numbers I do not recognize.)

Email: [gary.boyd@gmail.com](mailto:gary.boyd@gmail.com)

**The Five Tests of an acceptable Eagle Scout Project:** (from Proposal Page A)

1. It provides sufficient opportunity to meet the Eagle Scout service project requirement. You must show that planning, development, and leadership will take place; and how the three factors will benefit a religious institution, a school, or your community.
2. It appears to be feasible. You must show the project is **realistic for** you to carry out.
3. Safety issues will be addressed. You must show you have an understanding of what must be done to guard against injury, and what will be done if someone gets hurt.
4. Action steps for further detailed planning are included. You must make a list of the key steps you will take to make sure your plan will have enough details so it can be carried out successfully.
5. You are on the right track with a reasonable chance for a positive experience.